Saint Anselm of Canterbury and His Legacy

Saint Anselm of Canterbury and His Legacy is a collection of twenty-one essays based on papers originally delivered at a conference commemorating the nine hundredth anniversary of Anselm's death in 1109. The breadth of the essays presented in this volume reflects the enduring fascination with Anselm and his world in ways that stress both the continuities and discontinuities with the present day.

The essays consider the following: Anselm's legacy in his own lifetime and amongst the communities in which his living memory was preserved longest; the impact of his thought in the twelfth century; the rather different inspiration his thought provided in the thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries; Anselmian texts and their influence in vernacular translation, notably Middle English; and twentieth-century reception of Anselm's life and thought within Roman Catholic, continental Protestant, and Anglican history and theology, as well as the continued place of Anselmian argument within philosophical thought.

To study Anselm, and to study his legacy, is to enter a much larger world of reflection and interpretation on questions and issues he himself made central, and which concern some of the deepest subjects of human inquiry: ontology, creation, the purposes of human life, and matters of faith.



DURHAM PUBLICATIONS IN MEDIEVAL AND RENAISSANCE STUDIES General Editor Dr Giles E.M. Gasper Deputy Editor Dr Stefano Cracolici

DURHAM MEDIEVAL AND RENAISSANCE TEXTS Series Editors Professor John McKinnell and Dr David Ashurst

DURHAM MEDIEVAL AND RENAISSANCE TEXTS IN TRANSLATION Series Editors Dr David Ashurst and Dr Neil Cartlidge

> DURHAM MEDIEVAL AND RENAISSANCE MONOGRAPHS AND ESSAYS Series Editors Professor Alec Ryrie and Dr Stefano Cracolici

> > GENERAL EDITORIAL BOARD Dr Paul Bibire Professor James Carley Dr Robert Carver Professor Richard Gameson Professor Andy Orchard Dr Toby Osborne Professor Michael Prestwich Professor Corinne Saunders Dr Sarah Semple Professor Jane H. Taylor

DURHAM MEDIEVAL AND RENAISSANCE MONOGRAPHS AND ESSAYS 2

Saint Anselm of Canterbury and His Legacy

Edited by GILES E.M. GASPER and IAN LOGAN



Institute of Medieval and Renaissance Studies Durham University

Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies Toronto

Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing in Publication

Saint Anselm of Canterbury and his legacy / edited by Giles E.M. Gasper and Ian Logan.

(Durham medieval and renaissance monographs and essays, ISSN 2041-2959; 2)
Essays based on papers originally presented at a conference held at the University of Kent, at Canterbury, 22nd-25th April, 2009, commemorating the nine hundredth anniversary of Anselm's death.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
Co-published by: Institute of Medieval and Renaissance Studies, Durham University.

ISBN 978-0-88844-861-3

I. Anselm, Saint, Archbishop of Canterbury, 1033–1109 – Congresses. 2. Anselm, Saint, Archbishop of Canterbury, 1033–1109 – Influence – Congresses. 3. Theology – History – Middle Ages, 600–1500 – Congresses. I. Gasper, Giles E. M. (Giles Edward Murray), 1975– II. Logan, Ian, 1950– III. Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies IV. University of Durham. Institute of Medieval and Renaissance Studies V. Series: Durham medieval and renaissance monographs and essays ; 2

B765.A84S25 2012 282.092 C2012-901728-0

© 2012 Institute of Medieval and Renaissance Studies Durham University

Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies 59 Queen's Park Crescent East Toronto, Ontario, Canada M5S 2C4 www.pims.ca

MANUFACTURED IN CANADA

Contents

Abbreviations and a Note on References	ix
Preface and Acknowledgements	xi
GILES E.M. GASPER and IAN LOGAN	
Anselm: A Portrait in Refraction	Ι
Part One Anselm and His Communities	
SUSANNE SCHENK	
Queen Matilda and Anselm's Mary Magdalene	29
SAMU NISKANEN	
The Evolution of Anselm's Letter Collections until ca. 1130	40
VÉRONIQUE GAZEAU	
From Bec to Canterbury	
Between Cloister and World, the Legacy of Anselm, a <i>personne</i>	,
d'autorité	61
SALLY N. VAUGHN	
The Students of Bec in England	73
Part Two Twelfth-Century Perspectives	
JAY DIEHL	
Harmony between Word and World	
Anselm of Canterbury, Aelred of Rievaulx and Approaches to	
Language in Twelfth-Century Monasticism	95

vi | Contents

JUDITH DUNTHORNE Anselm and Hugh of St Victor on Freedom and the Will	114
MARK CLAVIER "Oro, Deus, cognoscam te, amem te, ut gaudeam de te" Rhetorical Theology and the Influence of Anselm on Richard of St Victor	133
Part Three Thirteenth- and Fourteenth-Century Perspect	ives
MICHAEL ROBSON Odo Rigaldi and the Assimilation of St Anselm's <i>Cur Deus homo</i> in the School of the Cordeliers in Paris	155
BERND GOEHRING Truth as Rightness in Anselm of Canterbury and Henry of Ghent	174
JOHN T. SLOTEMAKER The Development of Anselm's Trinitarian Theology The Origins of a Late Medieval Debate	203
VOLKER LEPPIN Praying and Thinking with Anselm The <i>Tractatus de primo principio</i> of Duns Scotus	222
Part Four Vernacular Visions	
MARGARET HEALY-VARLEY Anselm's Afterlife and the Middle English <i>De custodia</i> <i>interioris hominis</i>	239
evelien HAUWAERTS The Middle English Versions of Saint Anselm of Canterbury's <i>Prayers and Meditations</i>	258
Part Five Twentieth-Century Perspectives	
IAN LOGAN Was Karl Rahner an Anonymous Anselmian?	279

BERND GOEBEL	
The Myth of the Eleventh Century	
Hans Blumenberg's Anselm	299
emery de gaál	
The Rediscovery of Anselm's Appeal to Beauty in	
Hans Urs von Balthasar's Theology	318
GILES E.M. GASPER	
Tractarian Echoes	
Michael Ramsey and the Anglican Responses to	
Anselm of Canterbury	341
MARILYN MCCORD ADAMS	
St Anselm on the Goodness of God	360
EILEEN C. SWEENEY	
Anselm and the Phenomenology of the Gift in Marcel, Sartre	
and Marion	385
SARA L. UCKELMAN	
The Reception of Saint Anselm's Logic in the Twentieth and	
Twenty-First Centuries	405
MARTIN LEMBKE	
The Cosmontological Argument for the Existence of God	427
Contributors	445
Index	445 448
muun	440

Abbreviations and a Note on References

Anselm's works are indicated by title. The standard critical edition of the works remains the *Opera omnia* prepared by Dom F.S. Schmitt in one of two bibliographic forms:

S. Anselmi Cantuariensis archiepiscopi opera omnia, ad fidem codicum recensuit, 6 vols. [the first printed at Seckau, 1938, the second at Rome, 1940, all reset for the Edinburgh, Nelson edition] (Edinburgh: Nelson, 1946–1961).

Reprinted with new editorial material as:

S. Anselmi Cantuariensis archiepiscopi opera omnia, ad fidem codicum recensuit, 2 vols. (Stuttgart-Bad-Constatt: F. Frommann, 1968–1984). The particular translations used are indicated within each author's paper.

Southern, Biographer	R.W. Southern, <i>Saint Anselm and His Biographer</i> (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1963).
HN	Eadmer, <i>Historia novorum in Anglia</i> , ed. Martin Rule, Rolls Series 81 (London: Longman and
	Trübner, 1884).
PL	Patrologiae cursus completus: Series Latina, ed.
	JP. Migne, 221 vols. (Paris: Migne, 1844–1864).
S	F. S. Schmitt, S. Anselmi Cantuariensis archiepis- copi opera omnia (as above)
Southern, Portrait	R.W. Southern, Saint Anselm: A Portrait in a
	Landscape (Cambridge: Cambridge University
	Press, 1990).
VA	Eadmer, <i>Vita Anselmi</i> , ed. and trans. R.W. South- ern (Edinburgh: Nelson, 1962; repr. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1972).

Preface and Acknowledgements

The fostering and maintenance of modern academic fascination with Anselm can be attributed in no small part to the series of conferences organised from 1959 to the present day focused on his works and context. The year 2009 marked both fifty years since the first of these conferences at Le Bec-Hellouin (to mark nine hundred years after Anselm's probable arrival at the Abbey of Bec), and the nine hundredth anniversary of Anselm's death. During the course of 2009, a number of conferences, colloquia and services were organised to commemorate that anniversary including those at Canterbury, Bec, Saint Anselm's College, New Hampshire, and the Abbey of Tyniec in Poland. The Canterbury conference, held at the University of Kent campus, 22-25 April 2009, took as its title and theme, Saint Anselm of Canterbury and His Legacy. It is from this conference that the essays that follow were selected.¹ The 2009 conferences as a whole indicate the enduring fascination with Anselm and his world in modes that stress both the continuities and discontinuities with the present-day. A conference in November 2010 at the Pontifical Gregorian University, on Anselm and the Making of the New Europe, served to underline the relevance of Anselm studies to a wide range of contemporary issues.

I The Canterbury conference was organised principally by the Centre for (now Institute of) Medieval and Renaissance Studies, Durham University, and under the aegis of the Canterbury Centre for Medieval and Early Modern Studies, and the Internationale Gesellschaft für Theologische Mediävistik. Saint Anselm and His Legacy formed the annual conference for the IGTM, and the annual meeting of the society accordingly took place in Canterbury. In addition, the conference also enjoyed the patronage of the Société Internationale pour l'Étude de la Philosophie Médiévale. The conference organising committee consisted of Dr Giles Gasper, Conference Chair (Durham), Dr Pavel Blazek (Prague), Dr Alixe Bovey (Kent), Professor Gillian Evans (Cambridge), Dr Helmut Kohlenberger (Salzburg), Dr Ian Logan (Oxford), Professor David Luscombe (Sheffield) and Sr Dr Benedicta Ward, ost. (Oxford). The conference chair would like to take the opportunity to formally thank the organising committee, especially Dr Ian Logan and Professor David Luscombe, for all of their hard work and support.

The original 1959 conference served to give more focus to academic interest in Anselm; subsequent conferences grew in vigour and in the variety of subject areas encompassed. Although not exclusively so, the efforts of the International Anselm Committee, formed within the context of the 1959 conference, were of considerable importance in nurturing and presenting Anselmian scholarship in the second half of the twentieth century. Anselm scholarship owes a very great deal to the efforts, on this score as well as many others, to that committee.² The growth of newer foci for Anselm studies, such as the series of conferences in New Hampshire, is testament to the current vibrancy of interest within the area.³

The editors of the volume would like to express their thanks to the contributors, for their expeditious production of expanded papers, and for their cheerful response to changes requested or suggested. In addition, the editors are very grateful to the Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies and to the Institute of Medieval and Renaissance Studies at Durham, in whose publication series this volume appears, especially Mathew Gibson and Fred Unwalla. This is the second Anselm collection to be published by the Pontifical Institute, following the Stuttgart conference of 2004. The index to this volume was prepared by Laura Napran, to whose efforts the editors and contributors are indebted. Both editors would like to thank Professor David Luscombe for his continued advice on publication and other matters.

GEMG and IL

- 2 Amongst others, the International Anselm Committee has included, F.S. Schmitt OSB, Raymond Klibansky, Sir Richard Southern, and later Klaus Kienzler, Coloman Viola, Frederick Van Fleteren, Thomas Losoncy, Alessandro Ghisalberti, Helmut Kohlenberger and David Luscombe.
- 3 A list of Anselm conferences, and, where applicable, the volumes of essays they inspired are available at "Fifty Years of Anselm Conferences," accessed 31 May 2010, http://www.dur.ac.uk/imrs/conferences/anselm2009/50years/.